

**Kim's Marina
Addressing Exclusive Use**

Public Comment Summary and Analysis Report

**Prepared for the Bureau of Reclamation
Montana Area Office**

**by:
Aukerman, Haas & Associates, LLC.
May, 2008**

Table of Contents

I. Introduction.....	1
II. Report Purpose.....	1
III. Desired Outcome.....	1
IV. Process for Obtaining Public Input.....	1
V. Number and Sources of Public Comments/Suggestions.....	2
VI. Summary of Public Comments.....	2
a. Summary of Public Meeting Comments.....	2
b. Summary of Public Comments received by Mail and E-Mail.....	4
c. Summary of all Public Comments received.....	9
VII. Analysis of Public Input.....	10
a. Utilities infrastructure.....	10
b. Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) accessible facilities.....	10
c. New or improved facilities.....	11
d. Operations and Maintenance.....	12
e. Excavating of the Marina Bay.....	12
VIII. Conclusion.....	12
Appendix A: Public Meeting Flip Chart Notes.....	13

Tables

Table 1. Summary and categorization of all comments received.....	9
--	----------

Kim's Marina
Addressing Exclusive Use
Public Comment Summary and Analysis Report
May 2008

I. Introduction

In compliance with the current concession contract for Kim's Marina, the Montana Area Office of the Bureau of Reclamation (Reclamation) is conducting a public involvement process on the facilities and services that the public desires and believes should be provided to replace 12 existing mobile homes.

II. Report Purpose

The purpose of this report is to provide a summary and documentation of the public comments received; and to analyze these comments.

III. Desired Outcome

The desired outcome of the public involvement process is to assist Reclamation in determining the type of services and related facilities that should be provided at Kim's Marina in lieu of the 12 existing mobile homes. This report serves as the basis to formulate alternatives for a Phase II Recreation Analysis of the technical and financial viability of each of a minimum of three identified alternatives.

IV. Process for Obtaining Public Input

Paid newspaper advertisements and a news release were used to announce the public meetings that were held on November 27 and 29, 2007. The news release was also posted on the Bureau of Reclamation's Montana Area Office website at www.usbr.gov/gp/mtao.

Paid advertisements were run in the following regional newspapers on Monday, Wednesday, and Friday during the weeks of November 12 and 19, 2007.

- Helena Independent Record, Helena, MT
- The Townsend Star, Townsend, MT
- The Montana Standard, Butte, MT
- Bozeman Daily Chronicle, Bozeman, MT
- Great Falls Tribune, Great Falls, MT

The news release was submitted to the following regional newspapers with a release date of November 12, 2007.

- Helena Independent Record, Helena, MT
- Queen City News, Helena, MT
- The Townsend Star, Townsend, MT

- The Montana Standard, Butte, MT
- Bozeman Daily Chronicle, Bozeman, MT
- Great Falls Tribune, Great Falls, MT
- The Billings Gazette, Billings, MT
- The Missoula Independent, Missoula, MT
- The Missoulian, Missoula, MT

On November 5, 2007, a letter was mailed to 218 people on the Canyon Ferry Working Group mailing list. This mailing list is comprised of individuals who have expressed an interest in the management of Canyon Ferry Reservoir, such as local and regional residents, adjacent businesses, adjacent landowners, cabin owners and mobile home owners, local clubs, Congressional representatives, and other local, county, state and Federal agencies. The letter announced the planning process, the public meetings, and requested comments during a 60-day comment period. The letter and public comment form were also posted on the Bureau of Reclamation's Canyon Ferry website at www.usbr.gov/gp/mtao/canyonferry/index.cfm

Public meetings were held on November 27 and 29, 2007 at the Helena Regional Airport in Helena, MT to initiate the public comment period and planning process. The November 27th meeting was attended by approximately 30 people, and the November 29th meeting was attended by approximately 20 people. Many interested participants who attended the meeting on November 27 also attended the meeting on November 29.

V. Number and Sources of Public Comments/Suggestions

From the public involvement process, 120 separate comments/suggestions were received from approximately 64 participants. Forty-four comments/suggestions were received during the two public meetings. Seventy-six comments/suggestions were received from 14 mailed letters and E-mails.

VI. Summary of Public Comments

a.) Summary of Public Meeting Comments (11/27/2007 and 11/29/2007):

1.) Camping Area Improvements/Additions:

- Make use of existing open space, provide additional RV sites and re-design the existing camp loops (accommodate larger RV's; provide additional full hookups; maximize use of existing space; provide better trailer parking).
- Incorporate adjacent campgrounds (e.g., Chinamen's campground) into the concession area boundary to accommodate short-term use and allow additional seasonal use within existing concession area).
- Improve existing facilities, for example, add better wind shelters.
- Additional RV campground.
- Consider RV campground.
- Consider improvements needed for the safety of roads and campgrounds.

2.) Addition of Boating Facilities/Management:

- Public mooring facilities.
- Boat/car wash (Kim's Marina currently offers use of a power washer).
- Credit card automated fuel docks. Would need to comply with regulations for operation of fuel docks.
- There is a need for a boat ramp at Confederate campground.
- New breakwater at Kim's Marina, extend from cave bay to enhance Marina.

3.) Addition of Other Facilities:

- Lodges for overnight accommodations (not condos). Concerns expressed regarding improvements that would be high priced and possibly displace local Montana users.
- Fish cleaning station
- Fish cleaning station (example at Lake Havasu mentioned).
- Consider fish cleaning station.
- Group shelter, area for weddings, group events, etc.
- Day use facility (manage existing one).
- Additional area for cabins.
- Swim docks – 8-10 foot floating platforms.
- Park Model Rentals.

4.) Occupancy Rules/Seasonal Use:

- Consider the impact of increasing fuel prices on recreational activities, such as increase in demand for seasonal use; RV's will go to a destination and stay for a longer period of time.
- Concession contract requires a balance of short and long term uses.
- Seasonal use is more likely to generate additional income for the concession area.

5.) Dredging of the Marina Cove:

- Concern with low water years and increasing silt. Consider options to maintain water levels or increase depth to benefit sailboat use.
- Considerations to maintain water levels in the Marina, dredge the silt.

6.) Additional Marina:

- Consider the need for an additional Marina at Canyon Ferry.
- Consider the need for an additional Marina at Canyon Ferry to spread use out on the Lake, enhance the recreation experience, enhance safety and lessen crowding.

7.) Power System (Electricity):

- Power on the docks.
- 50 amp RV hookups.

8.) Septic System:

- Update the waste water systems and possibly expand.

9.) Parking Area Improvements/Additions:

- Parking area improvements.

10.) ADA Compliant Facilities:

- Improve accessibility in compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). What portion of this is Reclamation's responsibility?

11.) Fees/Prices:

- Consider increasing camping fees on weekends and reducing fees during the week.

12.) Other Comments:

- Leave it the way it is. Satisfied with the existing scope and price of services.
- Potential for Reclamation investment in concession area improvements. I would like to see my tax dollars being used to benefit the public in this way.
- Do not like idea of floating campgrounds.
- Consider "Green Development" and make use of solar and wind power options.
- Consider recommendations from the Commercial Services Plan 2004 that were identified for implementation as funding allows (fish cleaning station, additional RV campground, concession management of day use shelter).
- Consider funding opportunities from groups such as Walleyes Unlimited and others.
- Consider winter activities, such as those that have been popular at Goose Bay (perch fishing, ice skating).
- Replace the tennis court.
- Private land between Marina and Highway, consider opportunities to acquire.
- Difficult to find seasonal workers (given as a reason to not expand the Marina operation).
- Reserve campsites, online system.
- Implement the recommendations in the Commercial Services Plan

b.) Summary of Public Comments received by Mail and E-Mail:

1.) Power System (Electricity):

- Improve the power supply (electrical utilities) to the area, so that any concessionaire can expand their recreational facilities to meet public demand.
- Upgrade of electrical facilities by contracting for its installation.
- Having at least 30-amp electrical service at the campsites would make camping more enjoyable. 20 amps, which they now have, are just not feasible in this day and age.
- The 30 amp outlets are completely outdated; most RVs need at least a 50-amp breaker.
- The electrical system needs to be brought up to code.
- Update the electrical service in the sites 1-35. The 15-amp service is not adequate for the spaces. Most travel trailers today have 20 to 50 amp systems.
- Provide electrical hookups on the docks for the boats.

- Add power to the lower loop of campsites.
- Improve utilities.
- Add shore power to docks.
- Marina needs to desperately have a major upgrade in its electrical supply and distribution to the camp spots.

2.) Septic System:

- Upgrade of sewage facilities by contracting for its installation.
- The septic system needs to be brought up to code.
- The concessionaire could put money into the upkeep of the waste water system.
- There are some sewer outlets that back up and spill over on the ground with a wonderful smell.

3.) Water System/Water Facilities:

- Upgrade of water facilities by contracting for its installation.
- Water pressure is not adequate to take a shower or do dishes.
- Add a bath house and laundry facility.
- Shower-house.

4.) General Upkeep/Maintenance:

- The concessionaire could put money into the upkeep of the buildings and grounds.
- Improve the upkeep of existing facilities (i.e., regular maintenance of damaged Marina building, fences, public outhouses, sewage drop station, paved parking area to the north of the Marina building).
- There is too much junk lying around (i.e., old boats, campers, siding off the wall, old picnic tables and fence rails falling down).
- The camp trailer area west of the permanent trailers and the tennis courts need to be cleaned up. The concessionaire should be required to plant grass and trees to the barren dirt hill that now causes erosion and mud holes in the rainy season and dirt storms in the dry, hot season.
- Remove the tennis court.
- Remove the junk and burn pile on top of the lot at the west edge.

5.) Camping Area Improvements/Additions:

- Update the campsites to accommodate newer vehicles.
- Add two or three additional camping spaces for seasonal or short-term trailers (after removing the junk and burn pile on top of the lot at the west edge).
- There should be at least 15 more campsites to accommodate all users.
- Install additional pull-through trailer spaces with full hookups in unutilized areas of the assigned concession acreage.
- Develop seasonal RV sites with upgraded hookup services and drive-through capability on the empty field to the left of the entrance. That could potentially include the installation of “park models”.

- Develop the large grassy area on the left side of the road upon entering the Marina grounds into camp trailer sites.
- Add to campground.
- Build 20 more full service campsites as contractor recommended in Commercial Services Plan

6.) Parking Area Improvements/Additions:

- Update the parking lot to accommodate newer vehicles.
- Improvements or addition of more pavement to the facility.
- Paving the upper roads in the campsite and parking area to cut down on dust.
- Improve parking.

7.) Dredging of the Marina Cove:

- Provide a maneuverable waterway for boats by implementing a maintenance schedule for the dredging of certain parts of the reservoir at the Marina.
- Dredging the marina cove by government.
- Dredging the bay so that the boat slips are positioned back in the bay. As it is, when the water goes down, the slips are a true hazard as they go too far out into the Lake and make access to fuel difficult.

8.) Occupancy Rules/Seasonal Use:

- We support the concept of seasonal use at the marina.
- I think if a customer wants to leave their camper at their spot for the entire year they should be allowed to. The concessionaire should be allowed to charge them the exact same monthly rate they charge throughout the summer months. This saves the campers the trouble of moving their units for no apparent reason and would provide year round cash flow for the Marina owner.
- All rules developed by the BOR should be fairly and equally enforced for all campers. Presently, trailer campers are allowed to occupy sites for months on end. If the BOR decides that there should be greater access to the facilities, then they should introduce a policy (i.e., 14-day occupancy rule) that is strictly enforced.

9.) ADA Compliant Facilities:

- To comply with ADA standards, there is a need for accessible campsites (with and without utility hookups) and an accessible camp cabin. The existing cabins would be difficult to retrofit and it could be easier/more cost effective to build a new cabin. One of the trailer sites would work well since there is already water, power, and proximity to the existing cabins.
- The store and surrounding facilities (boat slips, ramp, cabins) need to be brought up to ADA standards.

10.) Fees/Prices:

- The BOR needs to have a bigger say in setting fees and prices on services. Some of the prices (i.e., dock rent) are excluding the average user.

- The last two or three seasons, the trailer owners renting spaces for the season have also had to pay a \$5.00 fee every time they launch a watercraft at the Marina's ramp. I feel that they should be issued a window decal that show that they are a full season customer and not have to pay a launching fee each time they use the ramp.

11.) Addition of Boating Facilities/Management:

- Place buoys around the perimeter of the swim area.
- Inside boat storage facility.
- Add to docks.

12.) Addition of Other Facilities:

- Children's play park,
- Group pavilion or gazebo for family picnics/weddings or additional cabins for short-term visitors (after removing the tennis court).
- Add a fish cleaning station.
- Park Models close to or on dock III.
- Add lodge for large groups.

13.) Other Comments:

- Control noxious weeds.
- Address noxious weed problem.
- During the last two season thefts have occurred in the camping areas. This calls for some type of security patrol or neighborhood watch.
- Take over the operation of other campgrounds.
- Build another marina
- The concessionaire could put money into the upkeep of the gasoline system.

14.) Mobile Homes (12 permanent trailers) should stay:

- They add to sense of safety/attractiveness of the area:
 - When travelers enter the Marina by car, one can see that the people who own the mobile homes are good stewards of the land. Knowing that these mobiles are at the entryway to the Marina provides a sense of safety for these travelers.
 - The owners provide access to a phone when an emergency occurs. There still is not consistent cell phone service at the Reservoir.
 - The area has an inviting, neat, park-like setting due to the good upkeep of the trailers and area by the owners. This has a pleasant, welcoming impression on the public when they enter the Marina and drive down to the store and docks. We feel that the trailer area adds to the aesthetics and a positive atmosphere without causing the Marina more work.
 - The permanent trailer owners maintain the grounds at no cost to the concessionaire. Over the years, they have planted and maintained beautiful lawns and trees that have enhanced the beauty of the area and increased

the value of the property. They have been good stewards of the nation's land.

- They provide year-round income for the Marina concessionaires:
 - The amount of indirect income that is coming from the people who own these mobile homes is immeasurable.
 - Mobile homes provide traditional source of income for Kim's Marina. Removing this income will force them to try to replace that income by developing more concession owned facilities. With all of their other responsibilities, I wonder if the owners will be able to properly manage and maintain an enterprise of this scope. In addition, more facilities might not be needed at this time, since the population growth rate and demographic changes of the area are slow.
 - The one area in the Marina that the concessionaires do not have to maintain but still receive year-round income is the area where the 12 trailers sit.
 - Many of the owners of the trailers spend a lot of time and money at the Marina. Other than the twelve months of rent, we also rent seasonal dock space, buy gas, groceries and numerous other purchases.
 - These 12 permanent trailers and the income they generate are vital to the Marina. Over the past nine years, I have observed fires, floods and poor weather that have kept daily campers away. When the fires raged and the Marina was closed, the only income the Marina had was the monthly rent from the permanent trailer owners. These 12 owners also rent seasonal boat docks, rent boats and buy groceries, licenses and parts from the Marina store.
 - The trailers are a steady income.
- They provide longer stays/seasonal use:
 - What I heard at the public meetings is that the people who are using Kim's want longer periods of stay. With these mobile homes, that is being fulfilled. They are not used, nor could they ever be used, year-round.
 - Presently Kim's contract states that the 12 mobile homes are "Authorized Visitor Services", hence by the nature of the contract they are not "exclusive use". A way to keep them in place is to have Kim's Marina provide a mobile home residence(s) within the concession area.
 - The fact that the trailers are physically on site year-round but unused for half of the year is similar to the permanent cabins that are occupied only during the summer season. The trailers are truly seasonal. If seasonal use were allowed, that use should also apply to the 12 older trailers.
- Other:
 - The area where the trailers are located is away from the Lake between the Marina and the highway. It does not interfere with any public access to the water, the docks or the store.

- There is still developable open space within the Marina that could produce additional income. It does not make sense to dismantle an income-producing, self-sufficient, attractive area that already exists.

c.) Summary of all Public Comments received:

The following table is a summary of all comments received during the public meetings as well as the public comments received by mail and e-mail. The summarized comments are presented under recommendation “categories” (left column) and the number of comments received for the each of the individual categories (right column).

Table 1. Summary and categorization of all comments received	
Recommendations:	Number of comments received
Camping area improvements/additions	14
Upgrade of power system/electricity	14
Addition of boating facilities/management	8
Improve general upkeep/maintenance	7
Occupancy rules/seasonal use	6
Dredging of the marina cove	5
Parking area/road improvements/additions	5
Upgrade of septic system	5
Upgrade of water system	4
ADA compliant facilities	3
Fees/prices	3
Addition of other facilities	16
Park models, Group shelter, Fish cleaning station	3 each
Other comments (varied topics)	17
Mobile homes (12 trailers) should stay	15

VII. Analysis of Public Input

Reclamation would like the concession operators to provide the services expected by the recreating public, and it is in Reclamation's best interest for those concession operations to be viable from a business perspective. Therefore, the focus of this study is to identify opportunities for recreation facilities and services that are in the public demand and are also financially feasible opportunities for revenue enhancement at the Marina. Although many comments and suggestions were received on a variety of topics, only those items that might directly or indirectly generate additional revenue for Kim's Marina are addressed in this brief analysis. Many respondents presented, well thought out and reasonable arguments supporting retention of 12 existing mobile homes. Even though these facilities are existing revenue generators for the marina, their retention or removal is outside the scope of this study. The following observations are only based on initial impressions from public input. Further analysis will be done in the second phase of this study that will provide Reclamation and the concessionaire with alternatives that are in the public demand and that would be financially feasible to consider for future development at the Marina.

a.) Utilities infrastructure:

Based upon the public input, it is apparent that some major upgrades or replacements of utilities infrastructure are desired, needed and may even be required by code in order to serve existing Marina visitors. These upgrades will probably be needed before most new facilities and services or increased use can be accommodated.

The utility upgrades that appear to be needed are:

- 1.) Electric upgrade to 50 amps and, as required, to code.
- 2.) Expand electrical distribution system to all areas of the Marina that has existing or planned facilities requiring electricity, including shore power to docks and the lower campsites.
- 3.) Upgrade the sewage system as needed to meet code, and the requirements of projected increased visitation.
- 4.) Expand water supply and distribution system.

Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) accessible facilities:

The public has pointed out that facilities at Kim's Marina need to be brought into compliance with the ADA accessibility requirements. Any new or existing facilities needing ADA accessibility should probably be identified and receive priority to bring them into compliance.

Facilities identified by the public that may need to be ADA accessible are:

- 1.) Campsites
- 2.) Cabin
- 3.) Store

c.) New or improved facilities:

Items 1 - 5 listed below, are facilities that are desired by the public and the Marina operators. They are proven moneymakers at other locations around the country, and should generate additional revenue for the Marina. These facilities all deserve further study.

Items 6 - 8 are facilities and improvements that probably would not directly generate additional revenue. However, they have been identified by the public as needed. They would enhance the Marina and could attract more visitation and longer stays. This should increase visitor satisfaction and indirectly increase revenue generation.

Item 9, an indoor boat storage facility is typically a revenue generator that could provide the best return on investment of any facilities and services being considered for Kim's Marina. However, other similar facilities already exist in the area, and only the concessionaire, not the public, suggested an interest in this facility. Further demand analysis is needed for this facility.

Item 10, a new breakwater, could protect the cove from wind and allow for more docks and access to docks and fueling in deeper water. This could be an alternative for excavating the Marina bay.

- 1.) Additional and improved RV and trailer campsites with full utilities and pull-throughs.
- 2.) Park mobile model cabins.
- 3.) Group picnic facilities- one new facility on the existing tennis court area, possibly with children's play area, and expansion and management of the existing Reclamation facility on Cave point.
- 4.) Expanded dock capacity.
- 5.) Group lodge.
- 6.) Fish cleaning station.
- 7.) Paved and improve roads and parking.
- 8.) Landscaping with trees and grass in the dirt storage, camping and parking area to the west of existing cabins and tennis court.
- 9.) Inside boat storage facility.
- 10.) New breakwater at Kim's Marina, extending from cave bay to enhance the Marina

d.) Operations and Maintenance:

Items 1, 2 and 3 listed below, are desired by the public currently using the Marina. They would not directly increase revenue, but could indirectly increase revenue by improving the Marina setting and visitor experience and satisfaction.

Item 4 would be a relatively simple way to help the Marina concessionaire increase revenue while providing a service to the public and Reclamation.

- 1.) Remove and control noxious weeds.
- 2.) Clean up the grounds-debris, burn pile, old equipment, and maintain buildings.
- 3.) Place buoy line around swim area.
- 4.) The Marina concessionaire should take over operation, maintenance, reservations and management of Reclamation campgrounds near the Marina, and the group picnic pavilion on Cave point.

e.) Excavating of the Marina Bay:

The need and value of excavating the bay to increase water depth is questionable. In discussions in the public meetings, the public differed in their perceptions of the need for and value of taking this action. Even the concessionaire questioned the need for this. The cost of excavating could easily surpass the benefits of additional revenue from expanded dock space and marina use. Probably, the only reason to do this would be for Reclamation to provide a service for sail-boaters.

VIII Conclusion:

The Recreation Analysis (Phase II) will focus on development of alternatives based on the identified priority areas of utilities infrastructure, ADA accessibility requirements, new or improved facilities and operations and maintenance. The results of the Recreation Analysis will provide Reclamation and the concessionaire with necessary information to consider on-the-ground implementation of future facilities or services at Kim's Marina that would best serve the needs of the recreating public, reservoir visitors, nearby communities and the concessionaire.

Appendix A: Public Meeting Flip Chart Notes

a.) Comments from Public Meeting Participants on 11/27/2007

Public comments from the initial brainstorming session:

- Leave it the way it is. Satisfied with the existing scope and price of services.
- Potential for Reclamation investment in concession area improvements. I would like to see my tax dollars being used to benefit the public in this way.
- Lodges for overnight accommodations (not condos). Concerns expressed regarding improvements that would be high priced and possibly displace local Montana users.
- Concern with low water years and increasing silt. Consider options to maintain water levels or increase depth to benefit sailboat use.
- Parking area improvements.
- Improve accessibility in compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). What portion of this is Reclamation's responsibility?
- Consider the need for an additional Marina at Canyon Ferry.
- Public mooring facilities.
- Swim docks – 8-10 foot floating platforms.
- Boat / car wash (Kim's Marina currently offers use of a power washer).
- Credit card automated fuel docks. Would need to comply with regulations for operations of fuel docks.
- Make use of existing open space, provide additional RV sites and re-design the existing campground loops.
 - Accommodate larger RV's
 - Provide additional full hookups
 - Maximize use of existing space
 - Provide better trailer parking
- Consider the impact of increasing fuel prices on recreational activities:
 - Increase in demand for seasonal use, RV's will go to a destination and stay for a longer period of time.
 - Concession contract requires a balance of short and long term uses.
- Park Model Rentals.
- Seasonal use is more likely to generate additional income for the concession area through purchase of items such as dock rentals, supplies, gas, etc.
- Incorporate an adjacent campground (i.e., Chinamen's campground) into the concession area boundary to accommodate short term use and allow additional seasonal use within existing concession area.

Public comments after watching slide show of potential ideas:

- Do not like idea of floating campgrounds.

- Consider “Green Development” and make use of solar and wind power options.
- Improve existing facilities, for example, add better wind shelters.
- Consider recommendations from the Commercial Services Plan 2004 that were identified for implementation as funding allows:
 - Fish cleaning station
 - Additional RV campground
 - Concession management of day use shelter
- Consider funding opportunities from groups such as Walleyes Unlimited and others.
- Consider winter activities, such as those that have been popular at Goose Bay:
 - Perch fishing
 - Ice skating

b.) Comments from Public Meeting Participants on 11/29/2007

- Consider improvements needed for the safety of roads and campgrounds.
- Consider the need for additional Marina at Canyon Ferry:
 - Spread use out on the Lake
 - Enhance the recreation experience
 - Enhance safety
 - Crowding issues
- There is a need for a boat ramp at Confederate campground.
- New breakwater at Kim’s Marina, extend from cave bay to enhance Marina.
- Consideration to maintain water levels in the Marina, dredge the silt.
- Power on the docks.
- Replace the tennis court:
 - Group shelter, area for weddings, group events, etc.
 - Additional area for cabins
- Fish cleaning station (example at Lake Havasu mentioned).
- 50 AMP RV hookups.
- Private land between Marina and Highway, consider opportunities to acquire.
- Update the waste water systems and possibly expand.
- Difficult to find seasonal workers (given as a reason to not expand the Marina operation).
- Reserve campsites, online system.
- Consider increasing camping fees on weekends and reducing fees during the week.

